



**OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES**

February 4, 2026 | 3:30 - 5:00pm

1. ROLL CALL / CALL TO ORDER

Members present (in person at primary location): Sonoma County: Supervisor Chris Coursey.

Members present (remote): Marin County: (Chair) Supervisor Dennis Rodoni; Mendocino County: Supervisor Ted Williams.

Members not present: Napa County: Supervisor Anne Cottrell

Staff and public present (remote): Marin County: Liza Massey, Bruce Vogen, Rich Levine; Mendocino County: Tony Rakes; Napa County: Mark Revis; John Buzolich; Sonoma County: Katherine Di Pasqua, Jack Kampmann

The NBNCBC Oversight Committee Chair Rodoni called the meeting to order at 3:32 PM.

2. INTRODUCTIONS

Chair Rodoni facilitated introductions of attendees, summarized above.

3. PUBLIC INTRODUCTIONS

No members of the public were present.

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

a. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: August 6, 2025

Supervisor Williams moved, and Supervisor Coursey seconded approval of the Consent Calendar.

Rodoni: Aye

Williams: Aye

Coursey: Aye

The motion passed and the consent calendar was approved.

5. GRANTS UPDATE

a. CETF Leadership Grant

- Awarded: \$125,000
- Spent to date: \$103,935
- Available remaining: \$21,065

b. CETF Local Government Best Practices Grant

6.

- Awarded: \$50,000
- Spent to date: \$4,350
- Planned: \$8,100 for the remainder of the Studio B contract for website/newsletter
- Planned: \$32,550 for affordable internet outreach (transit advertising)
 - Supervisor Coursey asked whether advertising on the SMART train system had been considered. Mark Revis answered that it had, however the group had been concerned that its ridership demographics didn't fit the target audience. Supervisor Coursey suggested that we review the SMART train ridership data again and the group agreed to do so.
 - Supervisor Williams asked whether the advertising would be bi-lingual. Mark Revis responded that it would.
- Planned: \$5,000 to equip the new Sonoma County Library with internet facilities

b. CPUC CASF Consortia Account Funding

- Mark Revis reported that Rebekah Heinze was no longer with Sonoma EDC and she had been performing the fiscal agent tasks for the Consortium.
- Due to the current grant rules, we were unable to do much work that was reimbursable by the grant for reasons that are discussed in the next agenda item.
- For the period ending January 31, 2026:
 - Fixed Wireless Analysis is approximately 50% complete.
 - Met with ISPs Valley Internet and Comcast

7. THE CHANGING BROADBAND ENVIRONMENT – DISCUSSION/ACTION

a. CASF CONSORTIUM GRANT:

- The NBNBCB Management team met in January to discuss the changing broadband landscape and related issues involving the CASF Consortia grant. The team produced a position paper describing the situation and providing recommendations. The position paper was part of the agenda packet.
- The intent of the BEAD program was to connect every home and business in the United States to broadband. The award of the BEAD grants will mean that there will be no need for further deployment grants (barring any defaults), and that the CPUC's requirement that Consortia such as NBNBCB work on assisting ISPs to obtain CASF grants no longer fits the reality of the broadband marketplace.
- However, many people will still not be connected even though broadband



is available to them. Many cannot afford an internet connection at current prices and many do not have the computer skills to effectively and safely use the internet.

- It is the opinion of the management team that the work of the Consortium should shift toward broadband adoption activities and away from deployment.
- Because of this, the CASF Broadband Consortia grant has grown less relevant, and at the same time has become more burdensome.
- An audit by the State Controller's Office has caused the CPUC to ask for significantly more documentation and ask more questions about every request for reimbursement. This has resulted in a significant increase in the amount of time the Fiscal Agent must spend on administration of the grant.
- The time for submission of an application for the next round of Consortia grant funding is coming up. Considering how little time we are able to bill to the grant, it is the opinion of the Management team that the benefits of the grant are outweighed by its drawbacks, and we should forego applying for the next round of funding.
- Summary of the Management team's recommendations:
 - Shift the focus of the Consortium from deployment to adoption activities, advocacy, and to be a clearinghouse for broadband data developed by the four counties.
 - Forego the next round of Consortium grant funding.
 - Look for sources of digital equity funding and perform digital equity projects as funding becomes available.
 - Continue to petition the CPUC for changes to their rules to allow consortia to be reimbursed for a wider variety of activities. Particularly digital equity activities. Consider re-applying for another Consortia grant if such changes occur.
- Supervisor Williams commented that rural Mendocino residents received very little benefit from the SB156 grant programs, except for the Federal Funding Account grants received by two municipalities and a native American tribe. He recommended that we make the reasoning behind our position known to our state lawmakers.
- Supervisor Coursey asked whether any other consortia were experiencing these difficulties. Mark Revis responded that at least one other consortium, the Redwood Coast Broadband Consortium, was considering dropping the Consortia grant for similar reasons.
- Chair Rodoni called for a motion to approve the Management team's recommendations. Supervisor Coursey so moved, and Supervisor Williams seconded.

Rodoni: Aye

Williams: Aye

Coursey: Aye



The motion passed.

8. MANAGEMENT TEAM UPDATES

Marin County (Liza Massey):

Digital Marin Connecting Communities/Marin Housing Authority Project: Five sites, two hundred residents (seniors or people with disabilities). All residents have access to free internet (90% take rate) and free devices (59% take rate). Have set up an external help desk for the residents (not tied to the County's internal help desk). Will now focus on training and continued support.

Regional Data Sharing (Bruce Vogen): Marin and Sonoma have mapped their Broadband Serviceable Locations (BSLs), their BEAD-eligible locations and the locations that were awarded to each preliminary BEAD recipient. The footprints of the various BEAD recipients overlap multiple NBNCBC counties, presenting a need for data sharing between counties. For example, one BEAD awardee has an especially low projected cost per Broadband Serviceable Location (BSL) (much lower than the costs per BSL projected by NBNCBC's Fixed Wireless Analysis which is underway) which could potentially lead to a default. A default in one county would likely result in a default in the other counties where the ISP also received a BEAD award.

LEO Satellite Providers: Bruce Vogen reported that the two satellite providers, Amazon Kuiper and SpaceX Starlink had both requested waivers of the BEAD grant rules. Amazon requested a two-year delay in the deadline to provide service, as they do not currently have enough satellites in orbit to provide effective internet service and do not expect to for two years. Starlink requested exemptions to grant reimbursement policies.

Sonoma County (Jack Kampmann):

Regional Data Sharing: Sonoma County collaborated with Marin County on developing the data sharing arrangement. The data shared will be an internal tool to assist the four counties in monitoring the BEAD rollout. Additional data layers have been included, including demographic data. Sonoma county is hosting the shared mapping site (ArcGIS). As information is received from ISPs and the FCC about the status of their buildout, that information can be added.

Mendocino County (Tony Rakes):

CETF Leadership Grant: Mendocino has used their portion of this funding to provide laptops for public use and digital skills training at the Mendocino County Library.

Napa County (Mark Revis):

BEAD Grants: Valley Internet and Trellis Communications, two fixed wireless providers, have received preliminary awards, as have AT&T and Comcast, both providing fiber. Amazon Kuiper and SpaceX Starlink received preliminary awards for territories in rural areas that overlapped award territories for the other terrestrial awardees.

Middle-Mile Initiative: Nothing to report since the state's budget cuts eliminated most of the middle mile in Napa County.

Other Grants: Napa County received two awards from the CPUC. The first is an award for approximately \$30,000 for a project to bring free wi-fi internet access to the residents of



the Calistoga Farmworker Center. Project completion is expected to be mid-March 2026. The second is an award for approximately \$83,000 to fund digital literacy classes in partnership with Napa Valley Adult Education. The grant also funds the purchase of approximately 133 laptops to be provided to persons completing the classes.

Grant Application Assistance: Napa County assisted local community organizations in applying for approximately \$108,000 in funding for two broadband adoption grants. Napa County is also working with the Napa Valley Farmworker Foundation to apply for another broadband adoption grant in the amount of \$45,000. Napa County is actively soliciting local community organizations to apply for broadband adoption grants.

Sonoma County (Additional) (Katherine Di Pasqua): Sonoma is distributing 556 free internet subscriptions and laptops to low-income households at public housing sites throughout the county, and has plans to expand the service.

9. PUBLIC COMMENTS: None

10. MISCELLANEOUS COMMENTS / QUESTIONS:

- Rich Levine asked whether NBNCBC should arrange meetings with the BEAD awardees. Mark Revis responded by asking whether that is something NBNCBC should do, or should it be left to the individual counties. Chair Rodoni suggested that the Management team should consider that question and report back.

11. MEETING ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 4:37 PM. Next meeting is May 6, 2026 at 3:30 PM. The meeting will be held via Zoom.